

Dehegemonizing Performance: Indian Women Performers in Quest of a Gender-neutral Existence

Dr. Aditi Bhunia Chakraborty
Assistant Professor of Humanities,
Heritage Institute of Technology,
Kolkata, West Bengal
aditi.bhuniachakraborty@heritageit.edu

Interpreting Identity in Performance through Language:

The relationship between language and identity is one of a very deeply entrenched type that has attracted the attention of scholars across the world since eons. Language performs the job of expression of identity in different fields and so does it manifest the true nature of identity in the realm of performance too. Since performance is a part of culture, it is undoubtedly a very important task to understand the inbred relationship between language, identity and culture, with special emphasis on performance as a part of culture.

The understanding between language, identity and performance in recent times, especially over the last two decades, have become a chosen subject matter in social science. One of the many queries that keep blowing our mind up, for example, is the difference between cultural and ethnic identity. Just as, there are arguments whether both types of identity should really be treated the same or should they be conceptually distinguished, likewise differing interpretations on the role of language in defining one's identity in a particular context or background are held by scholars such as Roosens (1989), Dorais (1991) and Stairs (1992). Thus the most important matter of contention that transpires out of this is that whether an identity of a person representing a particular genre or culture or ethnic group be treated inimitable, if it does not possess an individual, identifiable language of its own or, at least, its personal version of a common tongue?

This is a key concern within the territory of identity and performance which ultimately leads us to cogitate that the relationship between language, performance and identity is a stimulating one. This paper will explore the interconnectedness of the three and unearth the truth behind the influence of one's identity, in depicting gendered constructs in music, a forte that occupies a significant position in performing art. It will delve deep into understanding the gendered constructs by defining the three paradigms – language, performance and identity. It would then focus on the principal objective of emphasizing on the language of the performing artists in construing the identity of the performers. To clarify the reason behind choosing the language of the performers, it is important to throw some light once again, of course a little more precisely on the interconnectedness of language and culture, of which performing art is an integral part. In this work, we will initially discuss the interplay between language, culture, and identity and also emphasise on how these three constructs have evolved with time.

Defining the Three Essential Constructs— Language, Performance as a Part of Culture & Identity:

It is understood that though culture is inextricably linked to language, the relationship between language and culture is a complex one due largely in part to the great difficulty in understanding people's cognitive processes when they communicate.

Language is defined in a fairly different way by Wardhaugh and Thanasoulas, with Wardhaugh clarifying it for what it does, and the latter looking at it as it recounts to culture. Wardhaugh (2002) defines language to be a knowledge of rules and principles and of the ways of saying and doing things with sounds, words, and sentences rather than just knowledge of specific sounds, words, and sentences (2). Although culture per se has not been mentioned by Wardhaugh, there is an inexorable connection between the speech acts we perform and the environment they are performed in, and thus keeping in mind the consideration for context, Wardhaugh appears to define language in a way that Thanasoulas (2001) more unswervingly gathered in the following. ...language does not exist apart from culture, that is, from the socially inherited assemblage of practices and beliefs that determines the texture of our lives (Sapir, 2007). In a sense, it is 'a key to the cultural past of a society', guide to 'social reality' (Salzmann, 41). Edward Sapir, in his studies with Benjamin Lee Whorf, acknowledged a close affiliation between language and culture rounding off the fact that it was impossible to comprehend or appreciate one sans the knowledge of the other (Wardhaugh, 220). According to Wardhaugh, there unfurls to be three assertions concerning the connection between language and culture (219- 220):

The claims are:

- i) The practice of viewing the world by speakers of a particular language is determined by the structure of a language or, as a frailer understanding, the structure does not decide the world-view but is still enormously significant in making the speakers of a language motivated toward embracing their world-view.
- ii) Portrayal of the culture of people in the language they engage. People have their own notions about certain things and do those things in a specific way. They, therefore employ their language in ways that reflect what they believe and what they do.
- iii) The third claim which says that there is insignificant or no relationship between the two is a 'neutral claim'

Many sociolinguists contest the first of these claims but it is generally related to Sapir and Whorf. Since this claim serves as the groundwork for ample research on the correlation between language and culture, it is hence presented in the most detailed manner with a subsequent acknowledgement of the other two. The postulation that a relationship does not exist between language and culture, when we consider language for the communicative powers and its role in the culture that uses it, does not appear to be quite substantial. Though there are a lot of debates over the fact that analysis of a language and/or culture is feasible without any relevance of the other, the clarifications for such an analysis seem greatly uncertain. Language, being a means of conveying and understanding information, entails, for sure, the fact that there exists a relationship in which both the producer and receiver of a language espouse one or more roles. Taking into consideration such communication in its most insignificant forms i.e. the immediate setting – it would be rather tough to deduce that culture would by no means have a bearing on the interaction even on the smallest scale. The second claim proposed that relationship which promotes that the philosophy of a particular culture gets reflected in the language the people of that culture use, is a conflicting view of Sapir and Whorf in that here it is the 'thoughts' of a culture which are reflected in the language and not the language which decides the thought. This statement, could thus lead one to demand that cultures employ languages that are as varied as the cultures that express them and therefore linguistic functions differ in terms of a culture's level of technological development. Wardhaugh however, asserts

with purport that we should rather admit the fact that all languages have the resources to permit any speaker to say anything... as long as that speaker is keen to use some degree of circumlocution. (225-226). Wardhaugh explicates that when requirements for lexical items emerge, we can sign off on the fact that cultures are free to produce or to acquire them as needed, and that cultures that have not done so have not yet experienced the necessity (225). Wardhaugh also took cognizance of the fact that similar cultural features can be partaken by people who speak languages with different structures. It is also important to mention that similar structures in language can also be possessed and employed by people who have different cultures. Such features are found among the Hungarians and Finns and such examples do indicate that the second relationship between language and culture is quite workable. The assumption that the structure of the language governs how people see the world is what Whorfian hypothesis is all about and the first of the three proposed relationships is the bedrock for the Whorfian hypothesis. A widely accepted perspective that language, to a certain degree, governs the way we think about the world around us is known as linguistic determinism. 'Strong' determinism states that language essentially defines thought, and 'weak' determinism suggests that our thought is just influenced by our language (Campbell, 1997). The Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis, predominantly, deliberated on 'Strong linguistic determinism' and also on the idea that difference in language results in difference in thought, or linguistic relativity. These were, in fact, the basic propositions for Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis. Rummaging the diverse range of research on language and culture, it can be deduced that the structure and the skeleton of a language explains how speakers of that language interpret and view their world. The way the users of different languages view colour, linguistic etiquette, kinship systems etc. if that is scrutinized a little intensely, we will be able to appreciate that such things do help to explain that there is a fundamental relation between the two. Culture, including a plethora of events, ranging from music to sports, cannot be adroitly mastered without language, nor can it be efficaciously expressed and articulated. The very existence of language is ineffectual sans culture. Language, culture and identity are associated so immanently that it is difficult to explain the parameters of the three separately. It is reasonably important to learn whether language has bearing upon culture and identity or vice-versa. Scholars have generally been of the assumption that culture is a broader umbrella notion, and language is a part of culture (Trueba & Zou, 1994). Regardless of what the predominant approaches are, concerning language, culture and identity, these three inseparable notions help us to assume indubitably that language and culture shape identity and in so doing, contribute largely to the moulding up of a culture in a more universal manner. Though, there's a myriad of wide-reaching work done to have a bottomless probe into the profound relationship of language, culture (which considers performance to be an integral part) and identity but in the context of Bangla, there is a lacuna of research on how language impacts one's identity and have bearings on the culture as a whole or *vice versa*. The impact that sometimes creates an aura of hegemony and sometimes of subservience.

The linguistic and cultural systems within which an individual is bred and upraised, especially in the early years of socialization, by and large, play a conducive role in making a person socializing in nature, and in forging his perceptions and his persona, The linguistic system is thoroughly engaged in shaping one's distinctiveness, primarily because language is the system of communication encompassing codes and symbols which is used by humans to gather, merge, recover, organize and disseminate knowledge, know-how, expertise and experience. Language is not a fixed, inactive process. In the manifestation, circulation, and adaptation of culture, be it in beliefs, practices, cross-cultural interaction, performing art, language has always played a very significant role. Language is one such feature that has substantial contribution to sustain one's own culture and to acquire a new culture and new

knowledge. A more elaborate discussion on culture would gear us towards an understanding that culture has countless definitions, with one saying that it is a set of beliefs, ideals, norms, traditions, practices, and a way of life that extricates one group from another. Culture, according to Tylor (1958), is a motley of components which embraces knowledge, belief, art, morals, law, custom, and any other flair and behaviours rightfully acquired by man as a member of a society. Banks (1988) delineates culture as, “a cluster of attributes such as values, beliefs, behaviour patterns and symbols unique to a particular human group” (261). Goodenough is of the opinion that culture “is made up of the concepts, beliefs, and principles of action and organization” (5). To authentically describe what culture is, it can be said that culture, is not a paralyzed, deadlock entity. It is permutable and unremitting with the potential to acquire new features, forms and practices. To the traditional thinkers in the field of social science and anthropology, who are experts, in their field in true sense, culture however is “still composed of socially shared elements, socially shared norms, codes of behaviour, values, and assumptions about the world that clearly distinguish one sociocultural group from another” (Trueba, 34). Anthropologists and social scientists basically agree that sharing a culture of a group within the members of a society means being able to function efficiently in that particular group. Clifford (1986) opines that culture is not an idea to be represented intensely, nor is it a unified body of symbols and meanings that can be convincingly construed. Culture, rather, is worldly, it is objected, contested, challenged, and it is dynamic in nature. Culture is defined by Britzman (1991) as that domain where individualities, yearnings and investments are stimulated, created, and redesigned. If culture is such a changing and powerful site of mediation, then there is much in linguistic and cultural enterprises that need to be acknowledged, and a lot in learners’ roles and characteristics that need to be deconstructed and discerned.

George and Louise Spindler (1990) have claimed that culture is a process where a constant exchange takes place. The people who are involved in transmitting culture from one generation to another basically refashion, redefine and restructure culture while disseminating it. A considerable amount of literature on cross-cultural research that studies cultural socialization, cultural clash and learning (Moll and Diaz, 1987; Ogbu, 1987; Roosens, 1989; Trueba, 1987, 1988, 1989; Trueba, Jacobs and Kirton, 1990) is influenced by the work of the Spindlers. The Spindlers (1994) deal with the three aspects of the self—the enduring self, the situated self and the endangered self. The enduring self is the sense of cohesion that an individual has with the bygone, a personal interconnection with experience, meaning and social identity. The situated self, embraces those facets of the person as he unremittingly acclimatizes to the pragmatics of day to day living and to unfamiliar situations. This self is the involved self and is accustomed to the fulfillment of ends construed within the fabric of a social context. Finally, there is the imperiled self. When the adjustment of the situated selves is discordant with the enduring self, then friction arises. The reactions that humans come up with while facing such strife are confirmation of their ethnic identity, harmonizing adaptation, retraction, and behaviour against the grain. These adjustments are techniques of evading self-immolation. Spindler and Spindler (1994) state that the “basic cultural assumptions and perceptions held by people of different cultures seriously influence behaviour, perceptions and communication. They are the starting point of differential rewards, punishments, oppositions, consequences, and the use of power to coerce, eliminate, damage, and promote” (29-30).

Culture basically is a human origination which human beings are persistently brushing up and recreating. The aim of culture is to cater to various human needs, which also incorporate the finding of answers for questions humans are capable of asking that include a gamut from the most practical and concrete to the most philosophical and galactic.

Going by this definition, culture entails much more than barely "high culture," covering a bigger gamut of things, than the arts and humanities, music, literature, metaphorical art, or the cultivated social charms. Rather it denotes more widely to a specific people's shared knowledge, which include knowledge about their language, history, mythology, religious beliefs, world view, values, normative behavioural patterns, prevailing means of existence, and usual modes of social, economic, political, and religious organization. Much of this knowledge involves important symbols, the conventions of a culture's language, for instance, as well as other knowledge, such as the physical things related to it and how these are earned or made, and consumed. Moreover, if a culture is shared knowledge which is accumulated to help meet human needs and answer certain questions, it can also be conceptualized as a people's ideational design for how to live and how to behave (Keesing, 68-69 and 144). However, much of it submits by what means its members should live and conduct themselves. Thus, culture, indeed, is more an objet d'art of human knowledge, convictions, and actions than vice-versa.

Although Culture transforms conservatively but it is otherwise adaptive and capable of changing with changing environments, with changes in its ideational strategy stimulated by more practical and instant requirements. As a normal part of the human condition, certain continuous changes are acceptable but culture change that befalls too promptly can be a cause of damaging anxiety for the adherents of a culture. It happens because a culture is the outcome of a significant accrual of human experience, a product of its members' enduring adaptations to life in the region they inhabit, as well as their adjustments to more direct and contemporary situations. Culture, for that matter, should not be juxtaposed to modernization, because these two things have never been different. Nowadays, the phenomena of modernization are often just as much a part of contemporary cultures as the older, long-term traditions are. It should also not be presumed that all the members of a culture have the same notion about the things that have been discussed over here.

Elderly members belonging to a particular culture, for example, may regard modernization as alarming and thus it is always unwelcome, while the young members of a culture may heartily conform to it. Senior members of a culture may consider the days that have just passed by as "the good old days," while the younger members may regard it as underdeveloped, or backward. Significantly different views about these things might be held by the members of same age and gender. Therefore, someone who would make an effort to learn about a culture needs to remain thoughtful about the diversity of views that will normally be found within it.

Members of a particular culture unquestionably share a "great tradition," "majestic pattern," or "cultural identity." But as individuals they showcase culture, which are independent to varying degrees. This notion has given rise to the concept of 'subculture' which designates the different social groups or communities that share only a part of a general model of culture's larger system. Furthermore, the subcultures that are enclosed within the contours of a larger culture may have great shared aims with subcultures embedded within other discrete cultures.

There's a continuous ascension of new subcultures in today's fast changing world. These incessantly rising cultures at times distort the important cultural distinctions of earlier times that heretofore has differentiated cultures on the foundation of variances in history, language, society, economic organization, and religion. Various cultures over the last three decades have also gradually stressed more on the relatively new values as regards to the deployment of natural resources, which has often been professed as adversative and intimidating to the wellbeing of the people living in certain "native," "traditional," and "community-based" cultures.

Having an elaborate discussion on language and culture, it is time to delve into what identity is all about and the relationship it shares with language and culture. Identity in question is a gendered identity. Though it is not an easy task to define identity but it is assented worldwide, that without language, identity does not gain frontage. The understanding of ways and means of using a language as indices of social classes has an esteemed history. Such indices, almost since eons, have served as powerful decisive factors in shaping identities in most of the societies across the world. Even after the passage of several epochs, much the same associational understanding of the connection between language and identity guides the contemporary - and one would hope more benign - line of sociolinguistic inquiry that centres on the investigation of ethnicity or region or gender or age or occupation as “sociolinguistic variables” (Coulmas 1997).

Having raised the issue of language, working as an index for shaping identity, more precisely gendered identity, in the context of culture, we should devote ourselves a little more deeply into understanding certain basic concepts of Gender Identity and Language because the ulterior intention is to portray how language has played a pivotal role in shaping gendered identity in performance, where performance is treated as a popular component of culture. Judith Butler first clarified the notion of gender performativity in 1990, and it is now a fundamental element for researchers in view of establishing the link between gender and language. Baker elucidates this idea as “rather than people speaking a certain way because they are male or female, instead they use language (among other aspects of behavior) in order to perform a masculine or feminine identity, according to current social conventions about how the sexes should behave” (Baker, 2014, p. 3). Robin Lakoff’s own characterizations of gendered language use were first published in 1973, where she remarks that “there is a discrepancy between English as used by men and by women; and that the social discrepancy in the positions of men and women in our society is reflected in linguistic disparities” (2004, p. 72). She makes us cognizant of some of the features of a ‘woman’s language’; such as a question intonation in a declarative sentence, or a declarative sentence followed by a tag question, like ‘isn’t it?’. According to Lakoff, women’s language is characterized by higher frequency of fillers and hedges (such as well and kind of), empty adjectives (such as lovely and divine), as well as other means of politeness and hypercorrect grammar (“talking proper”) (Lakoff, 2004, p.78). Thus, a gender role or a stereotypical trait can be sustained through language by speaking about it, is Lakoff’s primary point of contention.

Having got to understand Lakoff’s argument, it is germane in this situation to appreciate the fact that the addition of the term, performance, to the nexus of language and identity, however, occasions a reorientation of analytical perspective. If we ponder on the notion of performance in the sense of linguistic practice - situated, interactional, communicatively motivated - our exploratory focus shifts from correlational sociolinguistics to the realistically inclined investigation of “when and how identities are interactively invoked by sociocultural actors” through the discursive deployment of linguistic resources (Kroskrity 1993: 222). From this point of view, identity is an embryonic construction, the situated result of a rhetorical and analytical phenomenon in which interactants make situationally driven selections from socially created archive of identificational and affiliational resources and use these semiotic resources into identity rights for presentation to others.

Identity is treasured unsurpassed as a plurality and not a unitary idea. It is a particular person’s acuity of the self, as well as the person’s realization of the social characterization of the self, within his/her inner group and the extended society. According to DeVos, construction of identity is not merely a mindful process but is ruled by unconscious psychological processes (DeVos, 1992). In a bid to judiciously define identity in the context of language and culture,

with performance being an integral part of culture, it is prudent to state that culture is perceived as an operating system of a society, which is additive and continuing. It acclimatizes and changes over time with members having numerous identities and having membership to multiple smaller groups in a society, thereby leading to evolution and formation of new societal and cultural identities. This work argues that language with the ability of tying and dividing groups in a society can act as a strong indicator of social and cultural identity at various levels of a society (Jaspal, 2009).

A language, thus, being a robust identity marking tool, at times, adopts an intentional strategy of vanquishing supremacy by playing the role of being authoritative and powerful. This kind of annihilation of supremacy adversely affects a person's and a nation's cultural tradition and social uniqueness. Considering language as a significant social and cultural marker of identity through a language rights approach, this paper will try to enquire and depict how in the field of performance, the male hegemony, which was forcefully in trend for quite a long period of time was at one point in time, threatened, by the appearance of the women in the field. The vociferous appearance of the women, ensured more or less an egalitarian existence of male and female in the field of performance. Not only had the mere presence of the women but also the language they banked on created a flavour of women's boisterous existence. This is clearly a productive line of inquiry. While acknowledging and exploiting the analytical power of this practice-centered perspective, it is however going to be sensible on our part to step into less well plotted investigative territory, steered by a more obvious conception of verbal performance.

Performance, in the context of this paper is principally classical vocal music performance. It is reckoned as a special style of situated communicative practice, harbouring on the supposition of liability to an audience for a demonstration of communicative skill and effectiveness. In this sense of performance, the act of expression is put on display, actualized, manifested to a degree from its conversational settings and opened up to revelatory scrutiny and evaluation by an audience. Performance foregrounds form-function meaning interrelationships through verbal display (Bauman 1977; Hymes 1975). The lyrics of the songs coupled with music, function as yardsticks of more intricate, but now attenuated, cultural wholes. These insignias of ethnic distinctiveness are operated and mobilized by cultural mavens in special performance events - primarily vocal recitals in which Indian culture is enacted, endorsed, personified, and placed on display. Before engaging in any further discussion on performance and performance events, how Indian vocal music performance creates gendered identity, it is crucial to develop an understanding about what Performance art is.

Conceptualizing Performance Art:

There is an inherent stumble block in arriving at a definitional understanding of Performance Art due to the intermingling of various elements in this form. However, one shall attempt to arrive at a broad conceptual understanding. The term 'Performance Art' emerged in the 1960s. It refers to an unconventional form of art, having a political bent, presented live to an audience. It is interdisciplinary, borrowing from song, dance, theatre, visual arts, poetry, etc. It is more a process than a finished product. In it, artists engage in a singular or multiple actions for a specific duration, in a specific site. The site could be any space like an auditorium, art museums, cafes, streets, etc. The live nature of the art imparts it a uniqueness and irreproducibility, thus making it ephemeral and intangible. Such elements are seen as challenging the commodification and institutionalization of art. Performance Art is dependent upon corporeality, the dexterity of presenting the art form and embodied-ness. It is the interaction of the artist's mind with an audience, at a particular time that lends the art credibility and reality;

imbuing it with an ongoing creativity wherein the audience offers its own meaning and shape to the art. It is merely the 'doing' of an actual action, which has some concentrated, evocative and political import. This is where the art happens. Amanda Coogan puts it thus in 'What is Performance Art?': "The performance frame is contingent and temporary, holding the performer in a liminal, provisional and suspended place. This frame of performance time is a particular construct the artist or performer steps into" (11).

Our perspective of dealing with performance, here in this paper is just with regard to vocal music performance. This paper shall try to probe into the credentials pertaining to the language of vocal music that imbued the gendered movement in search of a gender neutral identity in the field of performance.

Conceptualizing Language Function in representing gender Identity in performance art:

Language, in the context of performance, predominantly in vocal music, though becomes increasingly indexical and symbolic but before digging deep into the nuances of language, this article would investigate the characteristics of gender differences between professional settings of the performing musicians from the mid-1950s to 2000. First, we outline the various forms of gender inequality in the profession under study, such as the gap in employment and wage conditions, vertical and horizontal segregation and occupational vulnerability. We clearly observe a career differentiation according to gender that relegates women in less favourable positions than male artists with regard to employment conditions and earnings. Secondly, we focus on gender differentiation entailed in the lyrics of the Indian classical music, enacting identification with a group and differentiation from others. A probe into the corpus considered for carrying out the present study has revealed time and again that musicians are the only category for which we found a purely gender-related discrimination effect.

We would also lay emphasis on certain striking feature of these performances, especially the intensification of the linguistic ambiguities through the creation of additional spheres of uncertainty within the performance. This piling on of ambiguities requires complex interpretive effort, and the investigations - not to mention our interpretive travails, agreeably factored into the analysis - reveal that this interpretive work yields multiple and sometimes contradictory meanings. These amusing concerts problematize the connection of language to nationality, gender, class, region, age, and more. Identity arises from these performances as everchanging, labile, abstruse, and interpretively open. According to Marcia Farr's analysis of Mexican *ranchero* speech, it is not language per se (as linguistic code) that serves as an identificational resource, but a speech style, a way of speaking that is understood and employed as a means of enacting identification with a group and differentiation from others. In the genre of Indian classical vocal music too, the nuanced use of language in performance coupled with the style of rendition asserted the identity features of class, gender, ethnicity, and morality. All these features are brought into poetic relief and interpretively co-constructed by the performer and his audience.

In this performing form, the expression and negotiation of identity is referentially explicit rather than indexical, and the oppositional contrasts are more overtly manifest in the dyadic give-and-take and intertextual alternation of the song than they are in the dialogic resonances of unitary utterances. Within the limited range of a paper as this, one cannot do full justice to the descriptive and analytical richness of the data that has acted as the corpus of the work. Rather, we have attempted to suggest at least some of the insights to be gained by using performance as a point of entry into the investigation of the relationship between language and identity. In general compass, however, we would argue that it is the reflexive nature of

performance that renders it an especially privileged site for the investigation of the communicative constitution of social life, including the construction and negotiation of identity. Performance calls forth special attention on the part of performer and audience alike to the intrinsic qualities of the communicative act, to form, and this formal reflexivity in turn highlights the salience and cultural resonance of the meanings and values to which the performer gives voice. Verbal performances, then, turn out to be reflexive in several dimensions; not only are they linguistic forms about language, but also cultural forms about culture, social forms about society. Such performances, then, represent for participants an arena for the display, contemplation, and manipulation of salient elements, practices, and relationships that allow language to serve as a resource for the expression of identity. For the investigator, they afford an illuminating vantage point on the form-function-meaning interrelationships that must be at the center of a socially constituted linguistics (Hymes 1974: 195-209). Here, in this work too, we have tried to portray performance not as mere aesthetic embellishment layered upon some independently constituted social reality but as a phenomenon that has a lot to contribute in maintaining and understanding different social dynamics, especially through the language use.

Interpreting the language of the Hindustani Classical Music: Performance Art Ensuring the Making and unmaking of ‘Patriarchy’ in the Musical Framework:

Performance Art nurturing a style of presentation offers artists the benefit of evading the confines of behavioural codes, and exploring the politics of identity. This style is more straight as well as basic as it is and for women practitioners, this indicates the leeway of an expression unfiltered through a narrowed discourse like patriarchy. It offers them the liberty of an empirical rather than an archetypal art form. This paper shall look at how Indian women’s performance art contests the edicts and laws of gender and sexuality intrinsic in the Indian social situation. After outlining the elements of the genre, the contexts and practices of Indian women’s performance art, in the field of vocal music, interlaced with the language use, shall be discussed.

The key area being Hindustani vocal music, we will first try to unearth the nuances of the language of the music that portray the patriarchal hegemony and then try to unravel the gallant and daring stand of the women who have shown enough audacity for the creation and enlargement of personal space within the given structure of gender relations, with its singular specificity of subordination of women, within the predictable contours of this particular form of performing art. These women, thus in later times, through this art form tried to enforce a reverse social order where patriarchy was greatly diluted.

Ideas about gender, be it the enforcement of patriarchy or the implementation of the matripotestal. are thoroughly embedded in the discursive world of contemporary North Indian classical vocal music. Many aspects of contemporary North Indian classical vocal music are gendered: genres, singing off the cuff techniques, language and even certain frills conjure gendered connotations for musicians and listeners. However, earlier analytical work on this music has botched to take gender into account; as a result, the relationship between gender and music remains unexamined. In this work, I explore how issues of gender might come to bear on the close analysis of North Indian classical vocal music. Then an outline of the gendered musical panorama of the tradition has been tried to be given. In doing so, we have tried to draw upon the work by Judith Butler in order to theorise this gender-music relation. The argument that we try to put forward in this regard is that North Indian classical musicians do gender palpable manner and that this impacts the muffled nuances of musical style. Finally, I reveal

the ways in which reflections of gender, influence the stylistic pronouncements of one singer, specifying how she negotiates gendered musical norms.

When the renditions and the life of the musicians and music-lovers in Delhi, Mumbai, Pune and Calcutta, between the years nineteen hundred and fifty and two thousand, were inquired, the subject of gender frequently arose. Some affirmed the gendered bisection of labour, influencing the instruments and styles the musicians adopt while performing. Quite a good number of female singers announced the glitches of singing genres allied to the tradition of the present-despicable paramours. There is also an explicit discourse on gender and musical style, touching on issues of genre, the differences between pedagogical lineages and even ornamentation. However, despite this close relationship between gendered discourse and musical features, music-analytical work on North Indian classical music has largely ignored matters of gender. This paper addresses this lack, by exploring what a gendered analysis of North Indian classical music might entail. I argue that the fine details of the sounds and the language of North Indian classical music, accessible through transcription and analysis, are crucial to the gendering of the tradition. In bringing this to light, I advocate a fully contextualised kind of music analysis; I analyse musical sound in conjunction with ethnographic exploration of the musicians and listeners. This paper tries to demonstrate how this approach makes it conceivable to evaluate the social characteristics of musical sound, making the sagacity of musical characteristics intelligible.

Various scholars have examined gender and Indian classical music from historical or sociological perspectives but exploring it from the gendered perspective is still a virgin field. To assign a gendered flavour to the work, this work has most often dealt with female performers, especially those who fall under the umbrella 'courtesans'; that is, with groups of female hereditary performers who used to sing for male audiences and who would sometimes also engage in sexual relations with their patrons. A precise focus of this research has been a era of dramatic transformation in the classical performing arts, stretching across the span mentioned above. Characterised variously as a time of 'reform' or 'revival', this entailed a change in musical patronage from aristocratic to largely middle-class audiences; nationalism; efforts to standardise, systematise musical practice and efforts to dehegemonize male supremacy.

In a determination to dehegemonize male sovereignty in the field of vocal music performances, in order to unearth spaces or niches within the traditions where patriarchy was operative vociferously, Indian women have put in immense hard work for the creation and enlargement of personal space in the arena of music. Prior to the late twentieth century, it was quite unlawful for Indian women to be vocal even in household discussions and thus more so to express themselves through music or any other art on stage. After much bickering and after fighting for years to gain a more or less democratic position in the field of music, when they started employing their perseverance to an endeavour, they were marvellously successful. Women realised that the surest way of triumph over the closed horizon, where she was shut up in was to fight for gender egalitarian society creatively sculpted through their performance.

The broil started fetching very slow but gradual outcomes in the field of performance. Before we talk and delve into the notion of changing ideologies and changing practices that actually started setting trend steadily even beyond the concepts of equality and difference, we would first probe into the reality that this period of change had unequal consequences for male and female musicians. When at one point in time, the male musicians partook to reformation ventures and continued to be patronized as performers and teachers, the new takers of North Indian classical music leaned towards considering female performers (courtesans), among

whom music was handed down from one generation to another, as disgraceful and thus treated them sceptically. These female performers were defamed and marginalized and in the realm of North Indian classical music, they were largely substituted by middle-class, non-hereditary, 'respectable' female performers, many of whom had apprenticed themselves to male hereditary musicians. These performers though had the capacity to submerge their individual identity in the identity of the male performers, some characters, we have come across, did not symbolise the eternal woman figure. Apart from one or two such characters that readers generally do seldom come across, historically and sociologically analysed facts suggest that it was patriarchy and its structural framework wherein all the traditions were enacting social laws and precepts. My prerogative is to focus on women and discourse pattern of the songs pertaining to women, with some subtle attention to the discourses of such characters, who in spite of being traditional in their music style have been brave enough for the creation and enlargement of personal space within the given structure of gender relations, with its singular specificity of subordination of women. Some empirical data are selected from the *bandishes* for the purpose of demonstrating some aspects of discourse analysis principles. Alongside I will also make an effort to showcase some of the ways in which the theories and principles developed by linguists and conversational analysts for the systematic study of discourse and natural conversation may be applied in an illumined fashion in the stylistic and structural study of musical text. In spite of noting the 'interpenetration of music and language' in relation to gender and North Indian classical music, our research, will be mostly restricted to the linguistic side of the calculation. This article explores how to consider North Indian classical music's intricate strata of gendered connotation into account when doing close musical analyses of recorded performances. The paper examines North Indian classical vocal music in the light of gender theory, under the influence of the works of a powerful theorist like Judith Butler. In doing so, we bring together some of the actual hindusthani classical songs data that form the corpus of this work, along with their musical investigation in order to analyse gendered musical negotiations in detail. I call attention to the fact how discourses of gender and music cross with other discourses, fabricating a web of sometimes opposing social burdens on musicians. In doing so, I draw attention to one of the many musical and expansive intersections that, I claim, are a vital framework to North Indian classical recitals. If the crux of the paper is taken into account, then generally speaking, this article narrates a story about the sociality of musical sound. I use music analysis in order to put a spotlight on the various ways in which gender, including aspects of gendered history, leaves hints on contemporary North Indian classical music. With this article, I suggest that gender in North Indian classical music suggests a forceful example of the interlacing of musical and social processes. In a bid to making my suggestion convincing, it is vital to state that since both gender and music can be interpreted as types of performance, Butler's contention holds probable in intensifying the relationship between the two. Suzanne Cusick has been successful in persuading people to get convinced about the fact that musical performance is a means by which 'we project ... a gendered and sexed self that is intelligible to those around us' (1999: 27). Following Cusick's idea, I offer my understanding which proposes that North Indian classical vocal performances are powerful examples of the 'actions, gestures, or speech' by means of which gender is performed and emoted. The notion of performativity recommends the mechanism by which this occurs. Realized from this standpoint, recurrent, gendered musical performances do not simply echo or express the internal (gendered) identity of their performers; rather, as Butler puts it, 'the illusion that there is an inner gender core' (cited above) is in part produced by those very performances. Performativity thus operates through the medium of sound, so that even subtle musical details can seem to express gender. My claim is that musicians' performances of gender involve not only what can be seen, such as their stage behaviour and dress, but also what can be heard. Although often ignored by gender theorists, these audible signs of gender are just as powerful

as visible ones. They involve various aspects of musical sound, including the kinds of stylistic characteristics that are accessible through transcription and analysis, such as types of ornamentation.

Now to narrow down our focus to the songs, that is the *bandishes* of vocal music, it is important to mention that at the beginning, when music was merely a medium of worship, Hindustani classical music was predominantly adorned with *dhrupad*, a particular style which essentially contained deity-based cantos. Dhrupad is the earliest and most respected genre of North Indian classical vocal music. Musicians and listeners frequently define it as abstract, impenetrable and stringent. The lyrics, play a negligible role and are often incomprehensible. Dhrupad's abstract, music-theoretical flavour and its ostensibly ancient roots contribute to its status as a solemn and serious classical genre. The general impression that dhrupad is masculine partially holds true because of the gendered profile of its performers with most of them being men. Hindustani classical music has always had both male and female singers, with male singers being the dominant gender. Moreover, many musicians and listeners considered dhrupad's musical style to be masculine, or especially suited to men's voices. Amongst her informants, Maciszewski observed a feeling that men are better at singing dhrupad than women (1998: 204). Likewise, Manorama Sharma writes that the 'manner of singing' in dhrupad is 'virile and manly' (2006: 35). When women sing dhrupad, this often provokes discussion about the suitability of women's voices to the style. *Dhrupad*, when it subsequently came under the folds of the Muslim rulers, who clouded the art and culture of the time, Indian artists espoused a diverse kind of musical recital and method embracing the style established by the rulers because it permitted the artists, for the first time, to articulate their thoughts through the *khayāl gaayki* (literally meaning 'thought'). The *bandishes* were then sung in the *khayāl* style and were structured in the way, apt for *khayāl*. Apart from *bandishes* sung in *khayāl* style, more different kinds like *dādra*, *ṭhumrī*, *ṭappā*, *chaturanga*, *tarānā*, *sargam*, *ṭhumrī* and *rāgasāgar*, *hori* ... were adopted, which, regardless of being only semi-classical forms, became a priceless slice of the Hindustani classical music. Taking the gender aspect of this present effort into consideration, it is important to say that, as such Indian women performance artists have worked against phallogocentric representations that created out of 'woman' a singular, undistinguishable sign, inept of an agency. The agenda has been to infuse women with the subjectivity denied to them by patriarchy. It is of paramount importance, as Jeanie Forte points out in 'Women's Performance Art: Feminism and Postmodernism,' to utilize postmodernist deconstructive methodologies to de-structure the constructed subject-position resulting from cultural practices. This has led to the use of the body as an embodied presence, which by being the carrier of the accoutrements of signifiers and ideologies, could become a subversion of these very contexts. In Indian women's Performance Art therefore, apart from other issues, a preoccupation with women's marginalization has been central. The collusion of cultural, religious and political discourses in subjugating women has been probed. Such art-works of singing have tried to reform the spatial segregation of women by pursuing personal issues of women's lives in public spaces. By bringing their art into the everyday life they have tried to infuse it with greater audience-performer interactivity, also implicating the audience in the issues being addressed.

While both male and female classical musicians often sang *ṭhumrī* alongside *khayāl*, singers who specialised in semi-classical genres have been far more likely to be women than men. Lalita du Perron has pointed out how *ṭhumrī*'s lyrics have contributed to the sense of femininity surrounding the genre, highlighting their 'female voice': they almost always point towards a first-person, female protagonist (2002: 173). Our primary concern being the role of language in depicting gender, it is needless to mention that in none of these styles did language gain much prominence because Hindustani classical songs are not the kind of songs where language

has been given any edge over at any point in time. Words have only been composed and used specifically for maintaining patterns of rhythm and the *tāla*. Hindustani classical *bandishes* have always captured a *rāga*'s soul without much stress on the enunciation of the words and the language of a composition. Nevertheless, the verses, howsoever insignificant, have been instrumental in setting the mood and the tone of the *rāga*, but whenever employed, they have tried boisterously to enforce patriarchy and misogyny. The male and female dichotomy of polar opposites with the former oppressing the latter at all times though refuted in the Indian context because it has been the men who initiated the social reform movements against various social evils in India, but in the domain of Indian classical music, the lyrics of the *bandishes* most of the times raucously expressed masculinity and masculine power where women are depicted to be having the capacity to submerge their individual identity in the identity of the men. Going by what Beauvoir pointed in her book, *Second Sex*, it can be deduced that it has been a world where a woman has been taught to acknowledge masculine power. Thus the masculine world gives her an impression of awe-inspiring reality, an absolute.

In line with the thoughts of Beauvoir, where the masculine world leaves the woman in a state of awe, it has been seen in many *bandishes* that regardless of composer and the performer, the songs speak in the female voice. The lyrics are so composed, that they mostly depict the women to be desperate in appeasing and mollifying the male lover, with her appeals and entreaties but the man habitually vexes her by heartlessly staying away from her, displaying infidelity or worse, showering attention on another. One such example of a *bandish* is in *Rāga Hāmīr* where the *bandish* speaks about the love of a woman who is immensely keen to draw the attention of her betrothed. The lyrics given below bear testimony to the statement made above. But before we quote the lyrics, it is important to make the readers a little aware of the structure of Hindustani classical *bandishes*. Well-knitted, structured musical form set to a specific melodic form (*rāga*) and rhythmic cycle (*tāla*) having a text, lyrics, or poetry, the *bandishes* are systematically divided into different sections like the *sthāyī*, the *antarā*, the *sañcārī* and the *ābhog*. So the lyrics that we were talking about, pertaining to *raga Hāmīr* thus goes in the following pattern

Sthāyī – *Langarawā kaise ghar jāon, Sun pāve mori sās nanadiyā, Chhad de mohe dhīth*

A young lover, who has come to the river, to meet her beloved is imploring him to let her go home. She will be reprimanded if she is not back home in time. Thus the literal translation reads

(How am I to go home now? I will be rebuked by my in-laws if they hear about this)

Antarā – *Hoon jo chali panaghatava thādo, Kaun bahāne pyāre balama, Cheen lai mori sīs gagariya, Barajori tihāre (sundaravaa) |*

(I had gone to fill water from the river, and my beloved, in a bid to play pranks, snatched the pot from my head, detaining me at the riverside.)

Another well-known *bandish* with a comparable tone is from the *rāga Puriya Dhanaśrī*:

Sthāyī – *Pāyaliya jhanakār more, Jhanana jhanana bāje jhanakār ||* (The jingling of my anklets is intense -jhanana jhanana)

Antarā – *Piyā samajhāun samajhat nāhin, Sās nanad mori degi gāri ||* (My beloved is unwilling to understand my point of contention that if from the jingling of my anklets, the

people at home get to understand that I am willing to go outside with my sweetheart, my mother-in-law and sister-in-law (saas-nanad) will listen and they will curse me.)

All these *bandishes*, though rendered both by men and women, it is highly ironic to see both a man singing all this on behalf of that helpless woman, or a woman singing these lyrics, oblivious to the sexism hidden within them.

The *bandishes* cited above, constitute of lyrics that depict the image of an 'ideal' and 'chaste' woman conceived in the patriarchal set up prevalent in family life. The woman is immensely scared of her in-laws because of an overtly demanding husband who wishes to engage such acts with his wife, which might create a troublesome situation for the wife. This work, being based on sociolinguistics and considering the situation from the perspective of a sociolinguist, it will address the issue of conversational analysis in terms of speech acts, it will deal with how language is shaped and reshaped in the discourse of music and how it reflects and creates the social realities of life. Having mentioned the term "Speech Act", it is important to know succinctly what speech act is all about. In the [philosophy of language](#) and [linguistics](#), speech act is something that is expressed by an individual that not only presents information but accomplishes an action as well. Speech act theory stems from the notion that believed meaning descends from pragmatic tradition, demonstrating the importance of how language is used to accomplish objectives within specific situations. Thus, utterances not only reflect a meaning, they are words designed to get things done. [J. L. Austin](#)'s work, *How to Do Things with Words*, steered philosophers to pay more heed to the non-declarative uses of language. The jargon he introduced, especially the concepts of "[locutionary act](#)", "[illocutionary act](#)", and "[perlocutionary act](#)", occupied an important role in what was then to become the "study of speech acts". Both the *bandishes* talked about earlier entail perlocutionary act. Examples of perlocutionary acts include persuading, convincing, scaring, enlightening, inspiring, or otherwise affecting the interlocutor. While illocutionary acts relate more to the speaker, [perlocutionary acts](#) are centered around the listener. Perlocutionary acts always have a 'perlocutionary effect' which is the effect a speech act has on a listener. This could affect the listener's thoughts, emotions or even their physical actions. Both the *bandishes* comprise of lyrics that typically embody the perlocutionary speech act because it reveals the effect the speaker wants to exercise over the hearer. In both the cases, the mother-in-law and the sister-in-law have been depicted as ones capable of waxing lyrical, thereby creating a spell of fear in the mind of the daughter-in-law.

Many *bandishes* from many other ragas have been found to have the same words with a little rearrangement, keeping the spirit of the song the same –that is the woman who has always submerged her identity in the identity of the man. There are also a good number of *bandishes* where the woman is delineated as the one who faces violence within the hazardous periphery of the patriarchy dominated society. One such example can be like that of one composed in *rāga Todi*:

Sthāyī – *Langar kankariyā ji nā māro, mora angavā lāgi jāye* || (*Please don't throw stones-kankariya-at me, I'll get hurt*)

Antarā – *Sun pāve mori sās nanadiyā, daure daure ghar āve* || (*If my in-laws hear about this, I'll have to run from here to go home*)

There are some *bandishes* that also represent a woman who has tremendously low confidence or is continually rebuking herself, like that of one in *rāga Malkauns*:

Sthāyī – *Main piyā sang lad pachtāyi re, bhayī akal ki kāni re* || (I deeply repent being in conflict with my beloved. Oh I was such a dim fool!)

Antarā- *Taḍap taḍap ke giri se zuke, jaise mīn bin pāni re*|| (I am suffering gravely, like a fish without water.)

Explaining both the *bandishes* in terms of speech acts, it can be said that the latter two *bandishes* have heavily made use of “expressives” and “representatives”. Speech acts that make assessments of psychological states or attitudes are expressives and representatives are assertions, statements, claims, hypotheses, descriptions, suggestions. Both the *bandishes* reflect the psychological state of the daughter-in-law and both are statements describing their physical state.

A similar *bandish* says, *Mān le mori bāt saiyan, bīt gayi jug, nā māne saiyan/ Begi begi āo levo daras, Tarasat jiya morā* / (Here, the man is somehow unhappy and has gone away, and she is desperately convincing him to come again, since her soul is all full of grief without seeing him.)

She is portrayed to have nothing else to do but woo her man back – without him, her life has no meaning. In almost all *bandish* lyrics, a woman is depicted as someone desperate to please her man. The man, however, is highly cold-hearted and barely pays attention to this woman.

The *bandishes* referred to and studied, not only portray women as helpless, deserted and without agency, but also show them pleading favour and grace from the same oppressor scorning, mocking or even niggling them. All the *bandishes* in some way or the other reveal that by looking at the male as the divine and the female as mortals under his mercy and grace, everyone becomes female. Only God with whom they seek union in an *ātmā-meets-parmātmā* way, is male.

Though, I for one feel that it is unfair to use modern paradigms to judge compositions from an era when the norm was didactic patriarchy, but how can one overlook the profoundly challenging lyrics? Almost all *khayāl* and *thumrīs*, with *śringāra* rasa, though predominantly sung by male artists, have been expressive of the female voice yearning and rejoicing in her quest for the beloved. Women performing the *thumrī* didn't have a very fairy-tale kind of a life and were not fortified in the genre of classical music (women performing any kind of music were looked down upon anyway). Now the situation has changed with time, with almost an equal number of male and female *thumrī* singers.

Some examples of the *thumrīs* that are sung today:

Rāga Sindhurā: *Bālam tere jhagde mein rain gayi* (Oh dearest, you have wasted the entire night in the fight (argument). Sometimes the songs comprise of only a single line.

Rāga Tilak Kāmod:

Sthāyī– *Nīr bharan kaise jaoḍ sakhi ab, Dagar chalat mo seh karat rār mein* (O my friend, how do I go to fill water? On the way he (Krishna) teases me).

Antarā – *Eiso chanchal chapal hat nat khat mān, Tana kahu ki bāt, Vinati karat mein gayi re hār ab* (He is clever, impish, dramatic and very obstinate, he doesn't listen to anybody. I am weary of requesting him not to tease me).

All the *thumrīs* have the same essence. It is a wonder how singers have never seen or faced any felony singing these lyrics, which refute all hope for the upliftment of women. This traditional art form along with the language and its meaning has never created any niche for women allowing them to grow out of their old under-confident, repressed form. Though Performativity offers a powerful explanation for how these semiotic and semantic arrangements have always been into being and are sustained, it highlights the power of repetition, the repeated reconfirmation of their submerged identity, both in musical performance and discourse on the one hand on the other hand sets of gendered and other associations. The stylistic aspect of the performance, that includes the quality of sound in the recital, the way of delivery and many other parameters, contribute to the gendered construction of performers' bodies in North Indian classical music.

After a more or less thorough investigation of gender and musical style, my thought on this subject bears the reflections that over the last fifty decades the issues pertaining to the gender music and language have remained surprisingly constant. Though Hindustani vocal music was not composed afresh with new lyrics in operation but within the predictable contours of the old compositions, some masterpieces surfaced with transformations with regard to the depiction of women from helpless and heartbroken to bitter, resentful and assertive. There were compositions that transformed

Conclusion: Comprehending the Dehegemonization in Creation of Masterpieces with Transformations with regard to the Depiction of Women from Helpless to Assertive:

In this article, I have reconnoitred some of the techniques in which the social construction of gender works in sync with music and discourses on music. After setting out a broad overview of the gendered landscape of North Indian classical vocal music, I suggested thinking of particular musical features as instances of performativity and demonstrated how such features are implicated in musicians' strategic negotiations with gendered norms, how language has played a pivotal role in making a performance gendered, so on and so forth. I focussed on only a small sampling of features of North Indian classical vocal performances, I restricted my study to contemporary North Indian classical music; I did not attempt a comprehensive historical genealogy of the gendered associations of North Indian classical music, although this would be a very valuable project. However, I hope to have specified opportunities for future, more detailed analyses of gender in North Indian classical music and to have demonstrated the fertility of this area. The picture of North Indian classical music that emerges from this research is of a highly complex musical and discursive field. In this field, gendered discourses intersect with those on genre and ornamentation; they also come into dialogue with yet other discourses on music. In doing so, they artfully negotiate with conformist understandings of the music they perform, in search of prestige and professional success. This paper thus proposes a position on the necessary relationship between close music analysis and ethnographically based studies of language, music and gender. On the one hand, I propose that ideas about gender are thoroughly implicated in North Indian classical style and should be central to its analysis; on the other hand, I suggest that only work which engages closely with the fine details of musical sound can fully account for gender in this context. For ethnomusicologists, I would argue, paying close attention to musical nuances is a crucial step towards understanding the role music plays in wider social processes.

Though my study could not transgress the periphery of investigating the role language played in the construction of gender in Hindustani vocal music and taking cognizance of the fact that that this particular type of music was not composed afresh with new lyrics in operation but within the predictable contours of the old compositions, some masterpieces surfaced with

transformations with regard to the depiction of women from helpless and heartbroken to bitter, resentful and assertive, but it is for sure that the gendering of North Indian classical vocal style invites music-analytical attention: there is great scope for detailed study of the gendered significance of individual performances, styles or lineages. I demonstrate one such approach in the final section of this article. Before doing this, I first consider the social mechanism by which North Indian classical vocal style comes to be gendered. I suggest understanding this gendering through Judith Butler's concept of performativity: as an example of 'sonic performativity', which extends to the subtlest nuances of musical style.

Bibliography

- Alaghband-Zadeh, Chloe. 2013. 'Analysing Ṭhumrī'. PhD diss., University of London.
- Arlander, Annette. 'Is Performance Art Self-Portraiture? – Me or Other People as Medium' in *Converging Perspectives – Writings on Performance Art*, Annette Arlander (ed.), Episodi 3, Theatre Academy 2011, pp. 8-26.
- Baker, Paul. 2008. *Sexed Texts: Language, Gender and Sexuality*. London. Equinox Pub. Print.
- Bakhle, Janaki. 2005. *Two Men and Music: Nationalism in the Making of an Indian Classical Tradition*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Banks, J.A. 1988. *Multiethnic education*. U.S.: Allyn & Bacon.
- Barthes, Roland. 1977. 'The Grain of the Voice'. In *Image, Music, Text*, translated by Stephen Heath, 179–89. London: Fontana.
- Britzman, Deborah P. 1991. *Practice Makes Practice: A Critical Study of Learning to Teach*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Butler, Judith. 1999 [1990]. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York and London: Routledge.
- . 1997. *The Psychic Life of Power: Theories in Subjection*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Chandler, Daniel. 2007. *Semiotics: The Basics*. New York and London: Routledge.
- Clayton, Martin. 2007. 'Time, Gesture and Attention in a Khyāl Performance'. *Asian Music* 38(2): 71–96. doi:10.1353/amu.2007.0032.
- Clifford, James & Marcus, George (eds.). 1986. *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.
- Clifford, James. 1986. "Introduction: Partial Truths". In Clifford & Marcus (eds.). 1986. *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press. Pp. 1-26.
- Coulmas, Florian. *The Handbook of Sociolinguistics*. Blackwell Publishing Ltd. 2017. Print.
- Cusick, Suzanne. 1999. 'On Musical Performances of Gender and Sex'. In *Audible Traces: Gender, Identity, and Music*, edited by Elaine Barkin et al, 25–48. Zurich: Carciofoli.

- Dolan, Jill. 'The Dynamics of Desire: Sexuality and Gender in Pornography and Romance' in *Theatre Journal*, 39.2 (1987): 157-74.
- Dorais, Louis-Jacques. 1991. "Language, Identity and Integration in the Canadian Arctic". *North Atlantic Studies* 3(1): 18-24.
- Forte, Jeanie. 'Women's Performance Art: Feminism and Postmodernism' in *Theatre Journal*, Vol. 40. 2, (May 1988):217-35.
- Goldberg, RoseLee. *Performance Art: From Futurism to the Present*. London: Thames and Hudson, 2001.
- Goodenough, Ward H. 1976 (November). "Multiculturalism as the Normal Human Experience". *Anthropology and Education Quarterly* 7(4): 4-7.
- Jain, Jasbir. *Indigenous Roots of Feminism: Culture, Subjectivity and Agency*. New Delhi: Sage Publications, 2011.
- Jones, Amelia. *Body Art/Performing the Subject*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1998.
- Keesing, Roger M. 1981. *Cultural Anthropology: A Contemporary Perspective*. New York: Halt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Kroskrity, Paul V. 1993. *Language, History, and Identity: Ethnolinguistic Studies of the Arizona Tewa*. (35.) Tucson. University of Arizona Press.
- Lakoff, Robin. *Language and Woman's Place*. New York: Harper & Row Publishers, 1975. Print.
- Mulvey, Laura. 1975, 'Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema' in *Screen*, 16, 3, (Autumn 1975): 6-18.
- Roosens, E. 1989. "Creating Ethnicity: The process of ethnogenesis". In H.B. Bernard (Ed.), *Frontier of Ethnicity* Volume 5. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Spindler, G. & Spindler, L. 1990. *The American Cultural Dialogue and its Transmission*. Hampshire, UK/Bristol, PA: Falmer.
- Spindler, G. & Spindler, L. (eds.). 1994a. *Pathways to Cultural Awareness: Cultural Therapy with Teachers and Students*. Thousand Oaks, CA, US: Corwin Press.
- Spindler, G. & Spindler, L. 1994b. "What is Cultural Therapy?". In Spindler & Spindler 1994a, pp. 1-33.
- Striff, Erin. 'Bodies of Evidence: Feminist Performance Art' in *Critical Survey* 9.1 (1997): 1-19.
- Trueba, H. T. 1989. *Raising Silent Voices: Educating Linguistic Minorities for the 21st Century*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Trueba, H. T. 1993. "Race and Ethnicity: The Role of Universities in Healing Multicultural America". *Educational Theory* 43(1): 41-54.

Trueba, Henry T. & Zou, Yali. 1994. *Power in Education: The Case of Miao University Students and its Significance for American Culture*. London: Falmer Press.

Tylor, Edward B. 1958. *Primitive Culture*. New York: Harper.

Wardhaugh, Ronald. 2002. *An introduction to sociolinguistics* (4th ed.). Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd.